Andean Discourses of Power in Mid-Eighteenth Century Peru:
The Writings of Fray Calixto de San José Túpac Inca

Alcira Dueñas
The Ohio State University

Prepared for delivery at the 1998 meeting of the Latin American Studies Association,

In the mid-eighteenth century, challenging voices of discontent and proposals of social reform from Andeans reached the King of Spain, Ferdinand the VI. Writing their ideas of social justice and Indian power in memorials, letters, and petitions was a singular recourse of Andeans in an effort to put an end to the pressures of colonialism at times of impending rebellion in the Peruvian Andes. This paper undertakes a textual analysis of the "Representación Verdadera" to establish the main discursive strategies utilized in the construction of Andean discourses of power and social justice. The text was written in 1748 and has been ascribed to Fray Calixto de San José Túpac Inca, although the original was an anonymus text. This study proposes that, in advancing their own notions of Indian power, Andeans undertook a collective project of engaging writing by using rhetorical devices learned from their hispanicized culture and their own experience and knowledge to challenge the Hispanic cultural and political project of colonial domination. One singular modality of such agency was the reformulation of colonial Christianity, which functioned as a theoretical support of an Andean proposal of Indian power and social justice.

According to Homi K. Bhabha, any discourse or--"cultural performance"--incorporates a linguistic difference which is revealed in the split between the subject of enunciation and the content of the enunciation itself. In order to produce new cultural meaning, these two elements must be mobilized into a "third space" of enunciation in which "cultural knowledge is customarily revealed as an integrated, open and expanding code."2 Such a space is an "in-between space...a cutting edge of translation and negotiation which carries the burden of the cultural meaning." This is an ambivalent process which constitutes "the discursive conditions of enunciation that ensures that even the same signs can be appropriated, translated, rehistoricized and read anew."3 Such a rendition,--the production of Andean notions of power and cultural meaning--articulates, negotiates, and reformulates elements proper to the colonial discourse such as colonial Christianity and its various notions of "sin," "love," and "justice," in order to advance the positions of Andeans under colonialism. Locating itself in a space "in-between" the Andean and the hispanicized worlds, the "Representación" is also an undertaking of cultural translation. In other words, it is the author's engagement in presenting and legitimizing Andean notions of subaltern power in language and literary forms that were understandable and acceptable in terms of the European culture embodied in the king.4

In doing so, Andean scholars' discursive strategy conforms to what Bhabha refers to as "hybridity as camouflage," a relocation of subaltern agency in such a "third space." That is, the ways in which the subalternseizes the signs, ideas, and cultural symbols proper to the colonial discourse and displaces them to change their meaning in favor of his own ideas and projects. It is
such a notion of agency, which illuminates the way Andeans dealt with colonialism at the intellectual and political level. Bhabha defines such a notion of political agency as follows:

[T]here is a contestation of the given symbols of authority that shift the terrains of antagonism. The synchronicity in the social ordering of the symbols is challenged within its own terms, but the grounds of engagement have been displaced in a supplementary movement that exceeds those terms. This is the historical movement of hybridity as camouflage, as a contesting antagonistic agency functioning in the time lag of sign/symbol, which is a space in-between the rules of engagement.5

Túpac Inca used the various components of the colonial discourse of Christianity as symbols of colonial ideological power and subtly turned them upside down, reaffirming simultaneously the Andeans' acceptance of the basic principles and assumptions of such a religious doctrine. The hidden agenda of such a strategy is advanced as ideological negotiation securing the acquiescence of the reader.

A son of Doña Estefanía Tupac Inca, a member of the Inca elite, and Don Pedro Montes--apparently a Spaniard--, Fray Calixto de San José Túpac Inca professed to be a "descendant from the eleventh Inca King named Túpac Inca Yupanqui."6 He entered the Franciscan order in 1727 and was ordained as a lay priest in Spain in 1751. He held different positions in the ecclesiastical administration of Lima and the missions of the Province of Cuzco.7 Túpac Inca was assigned as a missionary to the Cerro de la Sal in 1748. By that time the rebellion of Juan Santos Atahualpa had already erupted in that area. Social conflicts arose from the imposition of the repartimiento de comercio (forced distribution of goods), the many abuses of corregidores (tax collectors with judicial functions), overexploitation in the mitas (forced labor in the mines) and obrasjes (textile workshops), and mistreatment of Indians by the missionaries, thus prompting Indians and mestizos to upraise everywhere in the colony. The "Representación" is basically a memorial which denounced such abuses, and presented a proposal for a total reform of the justice and administrative system in Peru. The "Representación" was a type of Indian-mestizo, collective project of writing, although Fray Calixto wrote the final document, or at least did a full editing of the initial writings from the caciques principales. Their concerns and interests were a major input in such a project. For the purpose of this paper, I assume that Fray Calixto was the writer of the "Representación," but, it is equally important to understand that the ideas in it also express the viewpoints of these caciques principales (Indian chieftains). Unfortunately, we cannot acknowledge personal authorship to them due to the lack of information about their names. Fray Calixto was consciously aware of this and of his role as political and cultural mediator between Andeans and imperial power. He visualized himself as a mediator before the crown, "your messenger and ambassador on behalf of the whole [Indian] Nation.8

The "Representación Verdadera" as a Cultural Text

Structure and Format

The "Representación" is a 59-folio letter structured in paragraphs and glossed with Latin headings taken from chapter V of Jeremiah's "Lamentations." Such subtitles seek to associate some of the grievances that the prophet Jeremiah addressed to Jehovah with the complaints that Fray Calixto addressed to Ferdinand the VI of Spain. The paragraphs illustrate the lamentations expressed in the Latin headings with examples and situations apropos to the colonial experience
of Indians in Peru. Fray Calixto's use of Jeremiah's poetic text in Latin--sometimes paraphrasing and sometimes directly translating the words of the prophet--was intended to elevate Ferdinand VI to the condition of God and to position himself, as the prophet, in a subordinate position but with enough power to speak and communicate intimately with him. Such an artifice was aimed at gaining the acquiescence of the King (the only intended reader) from the very beginning. By using the narrative format of the prophet's "Lamentations," Fray Calixto de San José Túpac Inca sought to envelop his critique of the state of affairs in late colonial Peru, presenting them as a lamentation, a demonstration of great sorrow subtlety intended to move the King's heart by persuasion.

Nevertheless, as we will see further on, the Franciscan subverted such format as his discourse unfolds, turning subtly from an innocuous lamentation to an open, radical critique of colonialism that involved not only the colonial administration but the King himself. Moreover, the Franciscan missionary goes beyond criticizing colonialism into proposing a whole social and political reform of the Spanish kingdom in the Peruvian Andes. The Andean writer used a language in the biblical narrative style, which invoked parables and metaphors to deliver a spiritual and political agenda involving a whole notion of social justice. Such rhetorical devices remind us of those developed in the *Nueva Coronica y Buen Gobierno* at the turn of the seventeenth century, allowing us to visualize an intertextual bridge between the two texts, which suggests the survival and incorporation of Guaman Poma's intellectual contribution to the Andean scholarship in the eve of the late colonial rebellions in Peru.

**Discursive Strategies and Main Ideas in the Text**

Immediately from the first page, the use of the monarchic discourse of the kingdom as a symbolic family appears as one of the missionary's most effective rhetorical formulas, which is inextricably connected with the use of Jeremiah's text. In such a discourse the King--the father--and the subjects--the Indians, his children--are bound by ties of reciprocity--mutual duties of protection and tribute respectively. On occasions, the friar projects such a discourse within the Church where the King would be the oldest brother--the heir--and the Indians the minor brothers, the subjects, the true inheritance--the home--that God bequeathed to the King. By paraphrasing Jeremiah's "Lamentations," Fray Calixto admonishes: "Your inheritance, Lord, that belongs to you as the oldest son of the Catholic Church, has been taken away by strangers...Your home has been taken away by foreigners...Lord, the Indians in this New World are your vassals...[and] only the Spaniards hold the secular and ecclesiastical positions."9 Drawing on such elaborations of the monarchic discourse of social harmony, from the outset Túpac Inca manipulates a language of sarcastic insinuation about the Spanish rule and the Spanish "foreigners" who monopolized ecclesiastical and secular positions, separating symbolically the Indians from the Crown and the Church.

Appropriating and elaborating on the aforementioned monarchic discourses of the symbolic family, Túpac Inca acknowledges the condition of Indians as subjects and, subsequently, fosters his first idea of social justice by presenting the Indians as orphaned subjects. "We are pupils and orphans...Where is the honor for us, your children, obedient, docile, and humble children?"10 Furthermore, the Andean priest wants to make the King aware of his disruption of the pact of reciprocity of the kingdom's family, since, as a father, he has not provided the spiritual food for his children--the indoctrination, the spiritual bread--which is reformulated by the missionary as "ciencias y letras" ("sciences and letters"). By claiming that "we are fasting from
this bread, because our father the King does not know whether it is imparted to us."11

Emphasizing the gap between the Law and the realities of social injustice, he clearly proposes that
the Indians' right to education be enforced, since it was legally established by the Spanish King.12

After this first charge, the friar invokes Saint Peter to emphasize that "Christians,
maintains Saint Peter the apostle, are a real and priestly generation."13 Thus, he authorizes his
claim that Indians must be allowed to hold positions of power in the Church, the religious orders,
and in the secular government. Fray Calixto makes this demand many times throughout the letter,
using different circumstances, to fix this claim in the King's mind. His insistence on this point
raises doubts as to the extent to which this was a popular concern among all Indians, or whether
entering the convent and participating in the ecclesiastical administration were mostly
preoccupations of élite Andeans such as Túpac Inca himself.

One of the most radical strategies is Fray Calixto's positioning of the Indians and the
Spanish administrators at the same social level, as both being subjects of the same King with equal
rights. He paraphrases Jeremiah saying that "[S]ervants rule over us: There is none to deliver us
from out of their hands."14 The friar thus refuses to acknowledge the position of subordination
of Indians to the Spanish officials in America, meaning that subjects must not be governed by
subjects, but by the King himself. What the Andean friar is doing, ultimately, is posing a new
notion of social hierarchy in colonial society. He suggested that the place of Spanish and Indians
be determined by their relationship to the Crown as the head of the symbolic family of the
kingdom, ignoring the racial assumptions underlying the colonial culture and discourse, thus
empowering Andeans.

Fray Calixto's construction of subalternity, however, is permeated by European racist
stereotypes and elitist notions of social hierarchy among the subaltern, which introduces tensions
in this Andean discourse.

The [E]thiopian [n]ation, black, slave and servant, in these Indies is our Mistress that
mistreats us and rules over us, along with the Spaniards your servants. Is there any
greater affront to us? Is it fair that the black slave be set free, and may go to Spain to see
his King, whereas the Indian, even the noble one, is a subject and mitayo [mita worker] of
your servants?15

Fray Calixto's ironic tone regarding blacks in this passage is used to deplore the fact that
Indians had a lesser status than blacks in terms of political and social rights. Here, the friar
introduces his discussion on the social hierarchies among the subaltern, by suggesting that, among
all Indian subjects, the noble Indians would deserve a higher status in society. These ambiguities
reflect Fray Calixto's internalization of such notions of hierarchy.

An Andean Proposal of Social Justice From Within the Colonial System

Apart from granting Indian access to positions in the ecclesiastical and judicial system,
one of the most radical proposals in the "Representación" was the abolition of the position of
corregidor and its replacement by Indian judges and Indian corregidores. Túpac Inca thus
proceeded to reformulate Indian subalternity by proposing that Indians owed allegiance only to
the king and the viceroy in worldly matters and to the bishops in spiritual ones. He practically
denied any kind of subjection to the local colonial administrators and ecclesiastical appointees,
insofar as those positions legitimately pertained to Indians. Coming from a missionary priest, the
recognition of allegiance only to the bishops imbues his proposals with radical overtones. Once
again the Andean friar brings to the King's attention a historical example rooted on the imperial practices of Spain in Europe to authorize such a reformulation:

And as the kings of Spain have dominated in Napes, Sicily, Milan, Flandes and Portugal, only the viceroys and governors have been Spaniards, and as for the rest of the subaltern positions, they were never taken away from the natives. The same policy must be maintained with the Indians, they must be their own corregidores, and the Spaniards should not interfere with them.16

To further support this proposal, the Andean friar presents to the King a rather pragmatic reflection on the advantages for the Crown of having Indians administer the collection of tribute. The Andean scholar focuses on the savings for the royal treasury that would result from the abolition of Spanish corregidores. Since Indian judges and corregidores would be elected, they would not have to purchase these positions, thus avoiding the loss of money from the royal treasury to repay debts as the Spanish corregidores did, and saving money for the crown. Abolishing the position of the Spanish corregidor, the repartimiento de comercio would also disappear. Indians would render the whole collection to the royal treasury as opposed to the Spanish corregidores, who used to take a good portion of it for themselves to clear the debts of the caciques and Indians, transferring only a small proportion of the tribute revenues to the king. Additionally, Indians could easily become indoctrinated because these fears toward the Spanish corregidor--the main cause of idolatry according to the Franciscan--would disappear.17

Having Indian officials managing tribute would avoid both delays in the payment of the curas doctrineros (parish priests) and usury derived from Indian's increasing debts with the corregidores. It would also save money for the caciques who were heavily indebted to the corregidores not only for the repartimiento but because they were not charged the official tax rates. Indians would also render their accounts punctually since they would not be indebted.18

Exhibiting an acute understanding of tribute management, the Andean friar manipulated the codes of the Bourbon administration--efficiency, minimization of costs, updating of accounts, and punctuality--, inspired by the theories of the "Enlightenment," which emphasized the rationalization of state finances and the centralization and political control of the colonies.

To enforce these proposals, our Andean scholar suggested setting up a new tribunal of justice that "depends directly on your Majesty, and that [the tribunal] be made up of one, two or more bishops and other noble people...very respectful of God and faithful servants to your Majesty, in conjunction with noble Indians and mestizos, the knights of the Spanish and Indian Nation."19 Thus, Fray Calixto negotiated Andean participation by proposing such an organization of justice tied directly to the king himself, in which representatives of Spaniards, Indians, mestizos, and the Church would share judicial power. In his view this governing body would guarantee the social and economic reforms proposed and also dignify the lives of the subaltern indigenous peoples under colonialism. Given the stratified and segregated nature of the colonial society in America, this sharing of judicial power between the colonial élites and a group of the subaltern subjects was a proposal too challenging to even be considered by the Crown. Radical as it appears, such a proposal acknowledges, however, no place or representation for a large sector of the non-élite, colonized Indians, let alone the vast sector of black and mulatto women and men, whom Fray Calixto de San José Túpac Inca recognized no higher status than
Indians. These factors make apparent, once again, the ambiguities of Túpac Inca's discourse of subaltern power.

**Conclusion**

The discursive strategies present in this collective project of combative scholarship show Andeans' singular use of the intellectual skills they learned from their Hispanized education along with their own knowledge and experience of subalternity under colonialism in order to demand social change and justice. Fray Calixto undertook a whole reformulation of colonial Christianity in Andean terms, at a time when one can easily perceive the advent of the Modern era and the increasing precedence of colonialism over traditional Andean religious practices and beliefs through the work of the Catholic missions and the legal system. This essay argues that the "Representación" manipulates the Christian discourses of love, sin, compassion, and justice, as well as the European codes of imperial rule, to construct a distinctive Andean discourse of power that fosters the social and political positions of Indians and mestizos in the colonial world. Fray Calixto and the unknown Andean contributors of the "Representación" reformulated colonial Christianity as an strategy of resistance, "the theoretical form of political agency," in Bhabha's terms.

In that sense, Andeans constructed discourses of power out of their bicultural background, positioning themselves as literary and cultural subjects in the interstices in between the Hispanic and Andean worlds. Fray Calixto's eager defense of the free admission of Indians and mestizos into the religious orders may be seen as an act of deep Christian conviction. But, judging from his own experience, his ordination to the priesthood was also the avenue for him to develop a social practice far beyond the conventional Catholic priesthood. His position as a mestizo priest, with close ties with Indians and mestizos, allowed him to use his clerical position to help dignify the existence of his fellows. This interpretation of Christianity appears to be a rather pragmatic reformulation, which empowers Andeans in a society where ecclesiastical hierarchies were indeed positions of power.

Degrading colonialism to the category of sin, and moreover, the worst of all sins, is also another element in this Andean reformulation of Christianity in the "Representación," which one may associate with Bhabha's "changing the grounds of contestation." In the same vein, the assumption that such a sin will have terrestrial punishment, as opposed to afterlife punishment for sins, also challenges the canon while reasserting a new notion of divine justice, which works in the earthly present of daily life to redress Indians' grievances, the "displaced grounds of engagement" according to Bhabha. Always accepting the central notions of the existence of the Christian God, the observance of Christian practices, even without questioning the role of the missions, the "Representación" speaks through the words of Jeremiah in tones that at times raise doubts over the existence of God, a god that seems to have forgotten to grant justice to Andeans. One can associate this move to what Bhabha calls "challenging the colonial discourse within its own terms"

In the "Representación" we are no longer listening the evocations of a golden age of the Inca past--proper to the Andean imaginary expressed in the ideologies of rebellion at that time and in 1781--, or even to the foretelling of the restoration of the Andean cosmic order. Rather, the "Representación" witnesses the implementation of colonial Christianity in the service of Andean agency and resistance (Bhabha's "changing the grounds of contestation"). On the other hand, Fray Calixto's reinterpretation of indoctrination as education in "Sciences and Letters," which equates
the need for knowledge to the need for spiritual food—the "spiritual bread"--, makes apparent his understanding of the new times that Indians were envisioning. It also reveals the influence of the "Enlightenment" in Andean thought of his time. This rendition of conversion as an instrument for fostering an educational project to empower Indians and mestizos reveals the Andean distinctiveness of such discourses of power.

Like all discourses and counterdiscourses of power, the "Representación" contains tensions and ambiguities. They attest to the cultural hybridity of the colonized subjects participating in their production. Thus, cultural values of race and gender permeate the manuscript as the construction of subalternity unfolds. Racial stereotypes regarding blacks, mulattos and zambos, as well as representations of indigenous women as pure, docile, and potential models of spiritual perfection stand as testimony to the European mores entering the Andean imaginary. The idea of subaltern power is also important to unravel the elitist bias of the scholars contributing to this project. The proposal of Andean participation in positions of power allowed for representation only of the élite sectors of the Indian and mestizo segments of the population. In a historical perspective, however, the idea of widening the scope of the political system so that traditionally subordinated groups of society were able to access political and social representation, constituted a valuable step forward to the achievements of avenues for democratization within colonialism. Indians' claims for social justice, at the same time, echoed the ideas of human rights that since the beginning of the colonial era in Latin America Father Bartolomé de las Casas exposed.

The whole preceding analysis demonstrates, ultimately, that the "Representación" constitutes a valuable cultural text for exploring Andean consciousness in the changing world of late colonialism. The distinctiveness of cultural hybridity in the Andes and the intriguing features of Andean agency derived from such a reality are major elements entering the mental world of the subaltern in the late colonial period, which merits substantial and significant research in the future.

Notes

1. "True Representation, And Sorrowful Lamentation With Surrendered Exclamation, From the Whole Indian Nation to the Majesty of the Lord King of the Spains and Emperor of the Indies, the Lord Don Ferdinand VI, Begging His Attention and Help in Redeeming Them From the Outrageous Affront and Dishonor in Which They Are Since More Than Two Hundred Years Ago. Exclamation From the American Indians, Using the Same That the Prophet Jeremiah Did for God in the Chapter 5 and Last of His Lamentations." "Representación verdadera y exclamation rendida y lamentable que toda la nación indiana hace a la majestad del Señor Rey de las Españas y emperador de las Indias, el Señor Don Fernando VI, pidiendo los atienda y remedie, sacándolos del afrentoso vituperio y oprobio en que están más de docientos años. Exclamación de los indios americanos, usando para ella la misma que hizo el profeta Jeremías a Dios en el capítulo 5 y último de sus Lamentaciones." AGI. Audiencia de Lima, Legajo 988. In Loaysa, Fray Calixto Túpac Inka, 7-48.

3. Ibid., 37. The notion of "in-between spaces" has been expounded since long time ago by several authors in various similar ways. According to Walter Mignolo, such an idea was presented as early as the sixteenth century by Nahuatl speakers who used the word "nepantla" to designate the inter-spaces between cultures. Walter Mignolo, *The Darker Side of the Renaissance. Literacy, Territoriality, and Colonization.* (Ann Arbor, 1995), xvi.

4. The notion of cultural translation was first utilized by Rolena Adorno, referring to the role of Guaman Poma de Ayala in making understandable the Andean mental and social worlds to Europeans in the *Nueva coronica y buen gobierno*. Rolena Adorno, *Cronista y príncipe*, 29-32, 86-87


9. "Vuestra herencia, Señor, que como a hijo mayor de la Católica Iglesia...os cupo en suerte, se ha pasado a extraños vuestra casa, a los extranjeros. Señor, nosotros los indios en este Nuevo Orbe somos vuestros vasallos...[y] los españoles...sólo son los que ocupan todos [las] dignidades...así eclesiásticas como seculares. Ibid, 7.

10. "Somos pupilos y huérfanos sin padre...Donde está la honra para vuestros hijos, y tales hijos obedientes, rendidos mansos y humildes?" Ibid.

11. "[E]stamos en ayunas de este pan, pues nuestro padre el rey no sabe si se nos imparte." Ibid., 8-9.

12. Ibid., 9.

13. Los cristianos, dice el apóstol San Pedro, son una generación real y sacerdotal." Ibid., 8.


15. "La nación etiópica, negra, esclava y sierva, en estas Indias, es nuestra Señora que nos maltrata y manda, a una con los españoles vuestros siervos. Hay mayor oprobio que el
nuestro? Que el negro esclavo se pueda libertar,...y pueda pasar a España a ver a su Rey, y el indio, aún el noble, sea tributario y mitayo de siervos? Ibid., 12.

16. "[Y] así como los reyes de España han dominado en Nápoles, Sicilia, Milán, Flandes y Portugal, sólo los [v]irreyes y [g]obernadores han sido españoles, y los demás oficios subalternos jamás se quitaron a los naturales. Debe hacerse lo mismo con los Indios, que sean sus corregidores, y no se metan los españoles con ellos." Ibid., 44.

17. "[S]uch a barbarian resolution is softer for them than tolerating the rigor, severity and violence that they suffered." "[S]iéndoles más docil tan bárbara resolución, que tolerar el rigor, aspereza y violencias que padecen." Hermano Calixto de San José Túpac Inca. Letter to the King Ferdinand VI. [1752]. In Loaysa. Fray Calixto Túpac Inca, 66. Thus, the Franciscan justified the idolatry of the Indians who escaped to the mountains rejecting indoctrination.


19. "[Q]ue inmediatamente estuviese sujeto a su majestad, que se compusiese de uno, dos o más obispos y otras personas nobles... muy temerosos de Dios y muy servidores de Su Majestad, en conjunto de los indios nobles y mestizos, caballeros de la Nación Española e India." Ibid., 45.

Bibliography


